

Influence Of Stakeholder-Participation Models In The Implementation Of Selected Rural Market Stalls Projects In Vihiga County, Kenya

Benard Muronga Kadurenge

The Catholic University of Eastern Africa,
Nairobi, Kenya

Raphael Ondeko Nyonje

Dorothy Kyalo Ndunge

University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya

Abstract: Development agencies that are advocating for increase in rural development projects acknowledge that stakeholder participation in development projects is so critical to the point that it has the potential to determine project outcome. However, there is little literature on the influence of stakeholder-participation models on the undertaking of various project life-cycle phases; yet project life cycle is fundamental in project management because how stakeholders are engaged in these phases determines project outcome. The available studies have tended to focus on the influence of the models on project outcome, ignoring the aspect of how the models influence specific project processes of initiation, planning, implementation and termination which are critical in determining what kind of outcome a project will have. This study was undertaken in Vihiga County of Western Kenya in order to establish stakeholder-participation models that were applied in the implementation of selected rural market stalls projects in this county; and also to examine influence of those models on the implementation of the projects. Being qualitative in nature, the study employed a case study design in which an in-depth examination of 4 purposively selected market stalls projects was undertaken. Document review, observation, key informant in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions were used to collect data; while content analysis, within-case analysis and cross-case analysis were used to analyze data. The study found out that top-down, contractual and consultative stakeholder-participation models were applied in the implementation of Jeptul, Chavakali, Majengo and Wemilabi market stalls projects and the models were largely responsible for the failure of the four projects.

Keywords: Rural development, Stakeholder-participation model, Market stalls project

I. INTRODUCTION

Rural areas can be defined as geographic areas or territories that lie outside the urban areas and are characterized by low population density, sparse settlements and agriculture as the main economic activity. Generally, rural areas are underdeveloped - as compared to urban areas - and this has become the main cause of rural poverty. Consequently, across the globe, there is a deliberate effort to improve the welfare of over 75% of the world population who live in difficult conditions in rural areas (Nchuchuwe & Adejuwon, 2012). This is true even for Africa where according to Nchuchuwe and Adejuwon, (2012), about 70% of Africans and about 80% of the continent's poor live in the rural areas and depend

mainly on agriculture for their livelihood. The other rationale for renewed interest in the development of rural areas is that these areas can no longer be neglected given that rural and urban areas do not evolve separately; and besides, rural areas also fulfill functions that are now critically essential to the lifestyles of the urbanized sections of the population (Leon, 2005).

A. RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN AFRICA

Rural development is the process of undertaking initiatives that are aimed at overall improvement of the quality of life of rural people (Nchuchuwe & Adejuwon, 2012). In Africa, rural development has become a priority issue owing

to the rural realities being experienced in this continent. Some of these realities deserve a mention here. For instance, the majority of poverty in Africa exists in rural communities; more than 70% of all impoverished Africans live in rural communities mostly dependent on agriculture for their livelihood; and agriculture in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) comprises nearly one third of the continental gross domestic product (GDP) and two thirds of employment, thereby making rural Africa a vital component in the overall economic development of the region (Donovan, 2013). In terms of overall income, agriculture is the main source of income for 90% of rural population in Africa (Nchuchuwe & Adejuwon, 2012); a situation that calls for diversification into and development of other sectors of the rural economy.

Confronted by these realities, many African nations are initiating rural development projects – and programmes – as one of the ways to realize rural economic development in particular and economic development in general. As a result, a multiplicity of rural development initiatives has been witnessed across the entire African continent. For instance, many countries in Africa including Ghana, Malawi and Tanzania have initiated small-scale irrigation development projects about which Sakaki and Koga (2013) observe that they are important as a way of increasing agricultural development, that helps to reduce poverty and ensure food security in rural areas of SSA where the majority of the poor live. In Southern Africa, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are actively promoting unique small-scale agricultural projects as examples of best practice for rural food security; three of which Leahy and Goforth (2014) have examined. The uniqueness of these projects is that they prioritize food security through household subsistence, using of low-input technologies, and a focus on surplus production for sale. In Ghana, Badu, Owusu-Manu, Edwards, Adesi and Lichtenstein (2013) have examined the initiatives that have been made to improve rural infrastructure and the challenges that must be overcome in this process.

In Kenya, the economic stimulus programme (ESP) that was implemented in the year 2009 was one of the ways by which the government of Kenya sought to spur rural development. Indeed, one of the objectives of the ESP was to expand economic opportunities in rural areas for employment creation. One of the flagship projects that were designed to attain this objective was the construction of market stalls in all the 210 constituencies in Kenya then. Market stalls projects were initiated in order to support the commercialization of agricultural produce by increasing the access to wholesale and fresh produce markets and increasing efficiency in marketing and trade of agricultural produce. This is supported in literature by Nchuchuwe and Adejuwon (2012) who observe that agriculture is the main source of income for 90% of rural population in Africa, and that there cannot be meaningful rural development without sustained effort in the development of rural agriculture.

The ESP in Kenya envisaged that successful market stalls would be established in 210 constituencies of Kenya with the help of relevant stakeholders at national and local levels. Stakeholders at the national level were the Deputy Prime Minister & Minister for Finance, the technical working group, the ESP secretariat, and the project implementation unit. At

the local (constituency) level, the stimulus project management committee and the constituency projects tender committee were constituted to help in the management of the projects. Other stakeholders at the local level were the prospective market stalls vendors, project workers and the project suppliers. In Vihiga County, one market stalls project was implemented in each of its four constituencies at that time namely Hamisi, Sabatia, Vihiga and Emuhaya constituencies, as part of the wider national ESP. The location of these market stalls are Jeptul town for Hamisi Constituency, Chavakali town for Sabatia Constituency, Majengo town for Vihiga Constituency and Wemilabi shopping center for Emuhaya Constituency. It is important to note that these projects are currently stalled at the implementation stage (cycle). As noted earlier, the focus of these projects was rural development and they involved stakeholders at both national and local levels.

B. STAKEHOLDER - PARTICIPATION IN DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

Stakeholder participation in projects can take various approaches including top-down, bottom-up, collaborative, consultative, contractual, and collegiate. These approaches are also referred to as stakeholder-participation models. Projects cannot succeed without the participation of its stakeholders. The need for active participation of stakeholders in project design and implementation as a means of ensuring project success is a subject over which development actors as well as project managers are at a consensus (Boon, Bawole & Ahenkan, 2013). Boon *et al.* (2013) further assert that stakeholder participation is inextricably linked to sustainable development and without many actors and approaches, it cannot be realized. Nina *et al.*, Omoro, Pellikka, and Luukkanen (2009) observe that participation is presumed to enable communities to manage their natural resources in an efficient, equitable and sustainable manner, other than increasing democratization processes.

Consequently, development agencies across the globe have made a deliberate effort to foster stakeholder-participation in projects as a way of enhancing project performance. With regard to this, Gillespie (2012 p. 254) observes that, "...In the fields of development and natural resource management, participation is such a widely accepted part of policy that it is rare to find a project or programme that does not exhort the practice of participation and stakeholder engagement..." This partly explains why development initiatives in all parts of the world are replete with examples of the effort that has been made by projects to ensure that there is stakeholder-participation. In the USA for example, several projects exemplify this: In 2014, Koontz and Newig studied three watershed management projects in Ohio State and found that they applied a collaborative stakeholder-participation approach which led to improved project results. In Florida, a watershed management project brought many stakeholders on board and Borisova, Racevskis and Kipp (2012) have studied the structural and procedural characteristics of this stakeholder involvement process. Unlike Koontz and Newig (2014), Borisova *et al.* (2012) did not study the effect of this process on the project life-cycle phases in particular, and the performance of the project in general.

In England and Wales, while studying flood risk management projects, Geaves and Penning-Rowse (2014) identified two broad groups of stakeholders that are engaged in these projects (which are on-going) whom they refer to as the public and the authorities. These two engage in contractual as well as collaborative stakeholder-participation while undertaking these projects as a way of enhancing productivity. In Germany, Baumann and White (2015) have studied a project on transport policy formulation in Munich City in which the stakeholders that were brought on board were beset by conflicts; and Baumann and White (2015) have demonstrated that collaborative stakeholder dialogue that was employed is a pragmatic technique for solving stakeholder conflicts in projects. In Germany as well, Koontz and Newig (2014) studied three watershed management projects in Lower Saxony State and found out that project stakeholders were engaged via a collaborative stakeholder-participation model which boosted the performance of the projects. As for Ireland, community participation in health projects in which communities work in partnership dates back to several decades and has been quite useful (McEvoy & MacFarlane, 2012). McEvoy and MacFarlane (2012) studied 19 projects that were meant to support and enable disadvantaged communities and groups to participate in local primary health-care projects; and recommend that a joint community initiative is the best way to solve primary health care problems.

In Indonesia, Gillespie (2012) studied oil palm plantations where the government of Indonesia is keen to improve the manner and benefit of stakeholder-participation in oil palm plantation programmes; especially the small-holder oil palm farmers. In Taiwan and Iran, Tseng and Penning-Rowse (2012) and Dadvar-Khani (2012) respectively conducted studies and concluded that although local people had basic motivation for participation in development projects, the top-down model that was used to engage stakeholders in such projects and the rigid political leadership existent were not appropriate for involving the rural communities in projects; a situation that limited the overall performance of the projects.

Africa has also experienced a tremendous effort to have stakeholders fully participate in development projects. In Ghana for instance, the International Center for Enterprise and Sustainable Development (ICED) implements many development projects and has adopted a quadripartite project participation model (QPPM) that is designed to facilitate the participation of all project stakeholders (Boon *et al.*, 2013). The QPPM is a three-tier stakeholder management structure comprising local project management teams (LPMTs), national project management teams (NPMTs), and international project management teams (IPMTs) with a transversal advisory quality assurance team (QAT). Other than terming it as the most effective in managing ICEDs relationships and communication with her partners and stakeholders; Boon *et al.* (2013) observe that it stimulates authentic participation, leads to consensus and capacity building, shared costs, and the fostering of networks and partnerships. As such, they recommend that the model is worth adopting by development actors operating at the community level.

In the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), stakeholder participation in projects is being seen as a critical ingredient in

the success of projects, given DRCs incessant conflicts that have derailed development for decades. As a result, the proposed Mongbwalu gold-mining project which is set to be implemented around Mongbwalu town in the north-eastern part of DRC, has finalized a stakeholder engagement plan in which a collaborative stakeholder-participation approach was used to successfully develop the plan (SRK Consulting, 2011). The preparation of the stakeholder engagement plan can be seen as a project in itself in which stakeholder-participation was given priority.

In South Africa, Lazarus (2014) studied the Railton Community Assessment Project in which a community-based participatory research approach was used to assist the local community and the Railton Foundation to identify priority areas for community development. Using a collaborative model of engaging stakeholders, Lazarus (2014) report that the community was able to identify priority actions and make recommendations about their implementation accordingly. In South Africa as well, after studying community participation in the establishment of Xaus Lodge in the Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park; Dyll-Myklebust (2014) has underlined the importance of local narratives in the co-production of knowledge that may guide development initiatives. In this project, local knowledge proved to be quite instrumental in the establishment of the park, because the local Khomani and Mier communities were treated as partners in the project that adopted a collaborative stakeholder participation approach.

The foregoing is illustrative of the effort that is being made all over the world in order to enhance stakeholder participation in projects and this resonates with the normative claims of stakeholder participation in projects that emphasize that meaningful participation can promote fundamental human rights and values such as democracy, procedural justice, citizenship, and equity (Larson & Lach, 2008; Reed, 2008). On the other hand, this effort is also informed by the instrumental (pragmatic) claims of stakeholder-participation that emphasize the benefits which stakeholder engagement could bring to easing implementation and enhancing project performance: That, by incorporating local interests and knowledge and even other material resources, policy solutions may be better adapted to local conditions thereby improving the results of any development endeavor (Reed, 2008).

While the foregoing studies have succeeded in showing how the stakeholder-participation models are vital in projects and how they generally contributed to project outputs, the missing link is that these studies do not address how the various models influenced the initiation, planning, implementation and termination components of the projects. Thus, the studies have focused more on the results, thereby ignoring the process which is equally critical in determining project results. Other than that, most of the studies have focused on the merits of the stakeholder-participation models while downplaying the limitations that go along with their application in projects.

C. STAKEHOLDER - PARTICIPATION IN RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS IN KENYA

In Kenya, there has been a continuing endeavor by the government and other development agencies to have local

communities actively partake in development projects. Nina et al. (2009) for example point out that in 2005, the Kenya Government introduced the 'Forest Act' which sought to transform and improve the management of forest resources. As a result, for the first time in Kenya's history, the 'Forest Act' introduced community participation in the conservation management of forests. This was a top-down model of engaging stakeholders since the Kenya Government was initiator of the new strategy, with local communities only being brought on board to help in its implementation. Nina et al. (2009) studied the transformation of the forest policy project in Taita Hills forest of Kenya and have pointed out the benefits that accrued from the project. They also report that although the Kenya Government was keen on involving the local community, the local community was not generally happy at the nature, level and benefit of their involvement in the project. Generally both the private and public sectors in Kenya have placed emphasis on the need for all projects to involve the relevant stakeholders. The Constitution of Kenya (GoK, 2010) for instance makes it mandatory for all public projects to have public participation at all stages.

D. THE ECONOMIC STIMULUS PROGRAMME (ESP) MARKET STALLS PROJECTS IN VIHIGA COUNTY

Under the ESP, Vihiga County - one of the 47 counties of Kenya - was allocated four market stalls projects that were part of Kenya Government effort to spur economic development in rural areas across the country. A market stalls project is a big structure in which vendors sell their goods and each vendor occupies a designated selling place called a stall. The client was the then Ministry of Local Government of Kenya. Each of the four projects was allocated to the then four constituencies in Vihiga County namely Hamisi, Sabatia, Vihiga and Emuhaya. The project location was identified as Jeptul town, Chavakali town, Majengo town and Wemilabi shopping center for each of the constituencies respectively. The projects were funded by Kenya Government through the then Ministry of Local Government. Project implementation and supervision were done by the then Ministry of Public Works, the Ministry of Health and constituency tender committees. Construction work commenced in July 2009 and the projects were supposed to be ready for commissioning by the end of 2009. However, this is not the case to date. In Vihiga County, all the ESP market stalls projects are stalled at different implementation levels yet each of them was allocated 10 million Kenya shillings; and were implemented using a uniform design. They are now categorized as failed projects.

The Chavakali project has the main building, an office block, toilets, a water tank, and a concrete waste bin; although electricity has not been connected to it. It is overgrown with shrubs and is located not more than two hundred meters from another bigger market stalls building. The Majengo project has the main building, an office block, toilets, a water tank, and a concrete waste bin; but it lacks electricity connection. It has now been taken over by street children and some members of the public as a resting and sleeping place. Small scale traders in agricultural produce sell their goods just besides the building in makeshift stalls or in the open, while a few of them operate from within the structure. The Jeptul project has only

the main structure, an office block and a water tank. Toilets, electricity connection and a concrete waste bin have not been done, and just like at the Majengo project, small scale traders in agricultural produce sell their goods just besides the building in makeshift stalls or in the open. The Wemilabi project has the main building, an office block, toilets, a water tank, and a concrete waste bin; although shelves have not been done in the main building and electricity has not been connected to the market. As a result, the prospective vendors sell their products besides the building in open air. Prior to this study, the reasons as to why these projects are stalled at different levels of implementation were not known, yet each of the projects had been allocated an equal amount of funds of 10 million Kenya shillings.

In a nutshell, there are studies which show that across the globe, projects are striving to apply various stakeholder-participation models as a way of structurally engaging stakeholders to improve project outputs. However, most of these studies have tended to focus on the influence of the models on project outputs, ignoring the aspect of how the models influence specific project processes of initiation, planning, implementation and termination which are critical in determining what kind of outputs a project will have (Baumann & White, 2015; Boon *et al.*, 2013; Borisova, Racevskis & Kipp, 2012; Dadvar-Khani, 2012; Dyll-Myklebust, 2014; Gillespie, 2012; Lazarus, 2014; Koontz & Newig, 2014; Nina et al., 2009; Geaves & Penning-Rowell, 2014; Scott, 2015; Smith, 2008; and Vernooy, 2006). This view is also supported by Sherman and Ford (2014) who note that, "... no study has evaluated the effects of stakeholder engagement in the actual implementation of adaptation initiatives ..." (p. 419).

For the ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County of Kenya, different levels of implementation have been realized yet it had not been known prior to this study why this was the case. Jeptul, Chavakali, Majengo and Wemilabi projects were all stalled at different levels of implementation yet a common design had been used and the projects had an equal allocation of funds of ten million Kenya shillings for each. As stated, the projects were scheduled to start in July 2009 and be completed in December of 2009 but this had not been realized at the time of this study. Prior to this study, no other study had been done to establish the cause of the current stalled status of the projects, how stakeholders were engaged and their influence on the varying implementation levels. It is against this backdrop that current study sought to establish stakeholder-participation models that were applied in the implementation of selected rural market stalls projects in Vihiga County, and consequently examine influence of the applied models on implementation of the subject projects.

II. METHODOLOGY

A research design is an overall strategy that is chosen to integrate the different components of the study in a coherent and logical way, thereby, ensuring that the researcher effectively addresses the research problem. This research which was conducted in April and May of 2016 applied case study design to examine four market stalls projects in Vihiga

County namely Jeptul, Chavakali, Majengo and Wemilabi projects. A case study is an in-depth examination of a single instance of a social phenomenon such as a person, a family, an institution or a project. Thus, the four market stalls projects were the cases that the researcher investigated. Since case study requires a deep understanding and elaborate presentation, the study used thick descriptions and explanations. Since the four projects have varying levels of implementation, there was need for in-depth investigation (via case study) of each of the market stalls project in order to understand why and how they are at their current varying implementation levels; as a basis of understanding the influence of stakeholder-participation models on their current implementation status.

A. STUDY POPULATION

Across the four rural ESP market stalls projects (cases) in Vihiga County, there was a heterogeneous target population of about 559 respondents. This population comprised of the various project stakeholders namely: Ten (10) officers who were in charge of the market stalls projects at national level, eight (8) Vihiga County Government staff directly in charge of the projects, seven (7) area political and administrative leaders per project, one (1) project contractor per project, one (1) project supplier per project, twenty (20) project workers per project, one hundred (100) prospective market stalls vendors per project, six (6) CDF committee members per project, one (1) officer of the defunct Vihiga Municipal Council, one (1) officer of the defunct Vihiga County Council, and one (1) MMC member per project.

B. SAMPLE SIZE

Sample size determination and sampling strategy were done using a non-probability approach. Vihiga County as the study location was selected using purposive sampling technique because the county has ESP market stalls projects which are stalled at varying levels of implementation, despite having received an equal share of project funds of ten million Kenya shillings per project. This makes them unique. A sample of four ESP market stalls projects was selected from Vihiga County to be used as units of study using purposive sampling technique as well because the four are the only ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County and they have unique implementation characteristics (Burke & Larry, 2012). The choice of a sample based on its unique nature in qualitative approach to research is supported by Burke & Larry (2012). For research respondents, the study selected a sample of 134 respondents across the four projects.

C. SAMPLING STRATEGY

Several sampling strategies were applied to select 134 respondents for this study. Purposive sampling was used to select the following categories of respondents: One (1) officer in charge of the ESP market stalls projects at national level, seven (7) Vihiga County Government staff in charge of the projects, two (2) area political and administrative leaders per project, two (2) project contractors (one contractor had 3

projects while the second had one), two (1) project supplier per project, two (2) project workers per project, one (1) CDF committee member per project, one (1) officer of the defunct Vihiga Municipal Council, one (1) officer of the defunct Vihiga County Council, and one (1) market management committee chairman per project. On the other hand, snowball sampling was used to get twenty-four (24) prospective market stalls vendors per project. Snowball sampling was used because this group of respondents was not accessible to the researcher at the time of the study. The rationale for sampling 24 prospective market stalls vendors was because the researcher opted to use two FGD groups per project whereby 24 respondents would yield the maximum number of respondents (twelve) for each FGD. This is on the basis that each FGD can have either 6-8 or 8-12 members. Out of the 134 respondents, 38 of them were interviewed while 96 were taken through FGDs. The study conducted a total of 8 FGDs (2 FGDs per project) involving prospective market stalls vendors.

D. DESCRIPTION OF RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS

The instruments that researcher used in qualitative data collection were the document review checklist, interview schedules, observation schedule, and FGD guides. These instruments were used alongside specific data collection methods as follows:

a. DOCUMENT REVIEW

Using this method, the researcher reviewed various documents that were relevant to the study. These included project letters, memos, field notes, photographs, minutes, the project plan, project drawings and project reports. The review of documents – apart from yielding research data – guided the researcher on what issues were to be addressed using the interviews and observation. The data collection instrument that was used with this method was the document review checklist. It was a list of documents that were reviewed and had space for comments that arose out of the review of the specific document.

b. KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW GUIDE

A key informant is a person (or group of persons) with unique skills or professional background related to the issue/intervention being evaluated; is knowledgeable about the project participants, or has access to other information of interest to the evaluator. For this study, key informants were interviewed individually and they comprised one key officer in charge of the ESP market stalls at the national level, project manager for each of the four projects, five county government officers who are conversant with the project, four project contractors, and four market committee chairmen. Unstructured face-to-face interview approach was adopted. The interviews permitted face-to-face contact with respondents, provided opportunity to explore topics in depth, and also yielded the richest possible data. The key informant interview guide was used by the researcher (who was the main research 'instrument') as a secondary tool, and it contained

open-ended questions that addressed the research objectives. The probing technique was used during the interviews to get as much information as possible from the respondents.

c. OBSERVATION SCHEDULE

The observation method of data collection involves observing a subject or a structure for the purpose of collecting data. For this study, external observation was used. In external observation, the researcher is not present with the subjects during project activities, but just observes as an outsider. In this study, the researcher observed various aspects of the project including the level of implementation and collected extensive field notes, which were used later in data analysis. The researcher also used photography to help in the observation process. The researcher was the main research 'instrument' aided by an observation schedule bearing a list of areas to be observed about the project. The schedule featured the following main areas of the market stall project: Main building, office block, toilets, water tank, concrete waste bin, the road network, lighting both for day and night and the general location of the market stalls project. The researcher indicated on the schedule if the features had been attained or not together with relevant comments.

d. FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS (FGDS)

The researcher used an almost similar set of questions to guide the FGDs as those of the key informant interviews. In addition, the researcher observed the group dynamics in order to supplement the FGDs data. For purposes of triangulation, FGDs were also used to clarify or confirm data that was collected through other qualitative research methods like document review, key informant interviews, and observation. For this study, FGDs involved 24 prospective market stalls vendors per project and each project had 2 FGDs. The FGDs were coed as follows: FGD A1 and A2 for Jeptul project; FGD B1 and B2 for Chavakali project, FGD C1 and C2 for Majengo project; and FGD D1 and D2 for Wemilabi project. The main instrument in this method was the researcher, aided by an FGD guide which had questions that were used to elicit discussions on the various aspects of stakeholder-participation in market stalls projects in Vihiga County. The FGD guide had guiding questions which were used to address the research questions. The data collection instruments were pilot tested before being used.

e. PILOT TESTING OF RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS

Research instruments in this study (the document review checklist, the key informant interview guide, the observation schedule, and the FGD guide) were pilot tested on an ESP project in Kisumu County. This case was Nyahera market stalls project in Kisumu West Sub-County of Kisumu County. Data was collected using document review, observation, interviews and FGDs. Data analysis was done using thematic analysis and conclusions were drawn. Based on the research objectives of the pilot test, adjustments were made on the research instruments as was necessary.

f. TRUSTWORTHINESS/CREDIBILITY

In qualitative studies, validity is referred to as credibility or trustworthiness and can be defined as the degree to which results obtained from the analysis of data truly represent the phenomenon that is being investigated. This is in tandem with Schwandt (1997) who defines credibility in qualitative research as how accurately an account represents participant's realities of the social phenomena and is credible to them. Burke and Larry (2012) note that credibility is the degree to which qualitative research is plausible, credible, trustworthy and thus defensible. Establishing trustworthiness focuses more on the degree to which inferences drawn from respondents' data represent their realities of the social phenomena. In this study, credibility was ensured by applying various types of triangulation, participant feedback (member checking), use of low-inference descriptors, peer debriefing, prolonged and persistent observation, and deviant case analysis.

e. DEPENDABILITY

In qualitative research, dependability is the term used to refer to reliability (Burke and Larry, 2012). Dependability is the degree to which the interpretations and concepts bear mutual meanings (are consistent) between the respondents and the researcher in which case the researcher and respondents agree on the description or composition of events, especially the meanings of these events (McMillan & Schumacher, 2000). To enhance dependability, the qualitative researcher gathers evidence to support the claim that similar findings would be obtained if the study were repeated using similar instruments (Wambugu, Ndunge, Mbii & Nyonje, 2015).

Dependability was enhanced in this study by applying qualitative strategies of consistency/dependability audit trails (with detailed documentation of data collection, analysis and rationale for vital decisions), sources triangulation, methods triangulation, and reflexive journal. It was also enhanced by traditional qualitative research techniques of inter-coder agreement (the three coders were consistent); and inter-observer agreement (the three observers were consistent). This involved the researcher observing what the 2 research assistants had observed and coding the same data as well; and found that there was consistency.

a. DATA ANALYSIS STRATEGY

Data analysis commenced in the field and continued concurrently with data collection. Data that was collected for this study was in the form of interview transcripts, and extensive field notes from open-ended exploratory interviews. It was also in the form of recorded observations (schedules and photographs), focus groups discussions, texts and documents, project drawings, BQs, minutes, reports and project plans. This study employed qualitative techniques of data analysis called content analysis (Attride-Stirling, 2001), within-case analysis (Cresswell, 2012) and cross-case analysis (Yin, 2009).

The foregoing methodology was applied to answer the following research questions:

- ✓ Which stakeholder-participation models were applied in

the implementation of the selected rural ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County?

- ✓ How did the applied stakeholder-participation models influence the implementation of the selected rural ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County?

III. FINDINGS

This study was undertaken on four purposively selected ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County with the objective of establishing stakeholder-participation models that were applied in the implementation of selected rural market stalls projects in this County. The other objective was to examine influence of those models on the implementation of the projects. Data collection was by document review, field-based observation, interviews and FGDs. A qualitative approach to data analysis was used where content analysis and pattern-matching were the main data analysis techniques that were applied within the broad framework of within-case and cross-case analysis. Consequently, various themes were identified and subsequently used to arrive at study findings. The researcher analyzed the content of data that was collected from various respondents and was able to isolate many basic themes that emerged with regard to the various research objectives and their respective research questions. The basic themes were then synthesized into organizing themes. There emerged organizing themes that relate to the type of stakeholder-participation models that were applied in the projects as well as those that relate to the influence of the models on implementation of the subject market stalls projects. The organizing themes were then used to arrive at various global themes that represented the various study conclusions. These findings are presented based on individual project.

A. JEPTUL MARKET STALLS PROJECT

Jeptul market stalls project is located in Jeptul town, which is along Chavakali-Kapsabet road next to the Kaimosi complex, in Vihiga County. There were various organizing themes that pointed to the application of several stakeholder-participation models which in turn influenced the direction that the project took.

a. TOP-DOWN STAKEHOLDER-PARTICIPATION MODEL

Several organizing themes emerged from data that was collected and analyzed and they are summarized in table 1.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in Jeptul stalls market project.	Organizing Themes
	The idea of constructing a market stalls structure in Jeptul town of Hamisi Constituency was conceived by the national Kenya Government officials in Nairobi.
	Planning for the Jeptul market stalls project was done by the national Kenya Government officials in Nairobi.
	No input was sought from the grassroots stakeholders or the the technical

	implementation team that was based at the Vihiga District public works office.
	Project funds were managed from Nairobi from the start to the end of the project; which decision was solely arrived at by the project client (the then Ministry of Local Government).
	All the key stakeholders at lower levels were not represented in the planning of the project that took place in Nairobi.
	After having been prepared by the ESP secretariat in Nairobi, the drawings and bills of quantities (BQs) for the project were passed down to be implemented by the lower level stakeholders without provision for alterations.
	Once the project had been handed over to the Vihiga Public Works officers for implementation, the officers did not involve some of the key project stakeholders at the local level in the implementation process.
	Global Theme
	The top-down model of stakeholder-participation was used to implement the Jeptul market stalls project.

Table 1: Themes relating to top-down stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of Jeptul project

From table 1, the construction of a market stalls project at Jeptul was conceived and planned in Nairobi (the capital city of Kenya) and that the local stakeholders had no idea about this project until its implementation commenced as (interviewee 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, and 10). During project implementation, the project team did not involve many of the project stakeholders at the local level (Interviewee 10, and 21; FGD A1, FGD A2). This explains why these stakeholders complained that they had been excluded from both the planning and implementation of the Jeptul project. The payment of the contractor was unilaterally centralized in Nairobi which delayed project activities. According to one of the key informants, due to incessant delays, project funds had not been fully paid for this project as at the time of this study. He remarked:

... Normally, once presented for payment, a payment certificate is supposed to be honored within one month. For my case, certificates of payment would take between six to ten months to be paid. This delayed the implementation of subsequent project activities. It also meant cost escalation due to the elongated project time which led to increase in costs. To date, I have not been paid over two million shillings. I have planned to go to Nairobi tomorrow to make a follow-up... (Interviewee 6)

Based on the foregoing organizing themes, the researcher established in a global theme that the top-down model of stakeholder-participation was used to implement the Jeptul market stalls project. In this model, planning for the project was done by the ESP secretariat in Nairobi, then the project was passed down for implementation by local stakeholders who included the Vihiga County Public Works office, the then Vihiga County Council, and Hamisi Constituency Development Fund (CDF) tender committee.

Since the study had also sought to examine influence of the established stakeholder-participation model on the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project, several themes were identified and are summarized in table 2.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of top-down stakeholder-participation model on the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project	Organizing Themes
	The views of the stakeholders who were excluded from the planning of the project were not used during the implementation of this project in which they were meant to be critical players.
	The rigid nature by which the project design was implemented resulted into some project structures in the design failing to fit in the available space that was provided for this project at Jeptul town. As a result, there was no space for the toilet block and this made the project to stall.
	The top-down model of stakeholder-participation also bestowed the unilateral decision-making powers on individuals who made decisions that were detrimental to the project. For example, the chairman of Vihiga County Council who unilaterally settled on small space in Jeptul town as the location of the project.
	The project as implemented, limits the scope of what is to be sold in the stalls; because it is designed for fresh produce only yet the vendors do not only deal in fresh produce, but other goods as well.
	The Jeptul market stalls have a limited scope with reference to the various needs of the vendors including failing to provide adequate space, security against burglary and comfort during extreme weather conditions.
	The market was implemented with a very limited scope with regard to the number of vendors to be accommodated because the stalls were designed to accommodate only 24 fresh produce vendors against several thousands across the constituency who require stalls.
	The paying of the contractor from the capital city of Nairobi according to client preferred time-lines; and extra project activities had the effect of delaying the entire project and thus lengthened the project time-frame.
	The lengthening of the project time-

frame, and the extra activities led to cost escalation as a result of increase in labor, material and transport costs.
Owing to the fixed nature of the project cost, the only means that was available to the contractor to complete the project without much financial strain was the use of less expensive material and labor; or reduction in the recommended quantities of materials; or both. This lowered the quality of the structures.
The client who initiated the project had sufficient funds and allocated the project Ksh 10 million.
Since it was the client who managed land within the Vihiga County Council under which Jeptul town is located, it was easy to allocate the project space without consulting any other authority.
Project beneficiaries like Vihiga County Government and prospective market stalls vendors were not required to contribute to the funding of the project. This was a positive influence as well.
As a result of the client having been a Government of Kenya ministry, it became easy for it (Local Government Ministry then) to coordinate all government officers - who worked on the project – under the ministry and in other ministries at the national level.
Global Theme
The top-down participation model of stakeholder engagement in this project had both positive and negative influence on project implementation.
The negative influence of the model outweighed the positive influence. This is evident from the fact that the project had stalled for about six years at the time of this study.

Table 2: Influence of top-down stakeholder-participation model on the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project

The organizing themes depicted in table 2 led the researcher to the global theme (conclusion) that the top-down participation model of stakeholder engagement in this project had both positive and negative influence on project implementation. However, the negative influence of the model outweighed the positive influence and this was evident from the fact that the project had stalled for about six years at the time of this study. The failure by top-down projects to achieve their objectives is not without precedent in literature. Nina *et al.*, (2009) concluded that the top-down model as applied in

the management of Taita Hills Forest in Kenya limited the participation of the local community who got disenchanted and withdrew support for the project; making it to fail to achieve its objectives. This means that this model is prone to abuse by the most influential stakeholders who limit the rights and freedoms of the less influential ones (Tseng and Penning-Rowsell, 2012). This eventuality would have been avoided if planning and implementation of the project had applied the bottom-up stakeholder-participation model as well. This is because by its very nature, the bottom-up approach encourages projects to seek for, appreciate and apply local knowledge, and to consider local people themselves as the appropriate experts about their local environments (Chambers, 1997). This then leads to projects that win support from across the spectrum of project stakeholders from the beginning up to the end.

b. THE CONTRACTUAL STAKEHOLDER-PARTICIPATION MODEL

Various themes emerged relating to contractual stakeholder-participation model in the Jeptul project as summarized in table 3.

FOCUS	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in Jeptul stalls market project	Organizing Themes
	There was a contract between the client and the contractor.
	The contract was in written form.
	There was an official session during which the client and the contractor signed the contract documents.
	Project workers were engaged in the project by way of a contract.
	A contract existed between the contractor and the project suppliers.
	Global Theme/Conclusion
There was evidence to confirm that there was a contractual engagement between the project client and contractor in implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project; as well as between the contractor and workers/suppliers.	

Table 3: Themes on contractual stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of Jeptul project

The foregoing organizing themes led the researcher to the global theme that the contractual stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of Jeptul market stalls project. This involved the client and the contractor on the one hand; and the contractor, the workers and the suppliers on the other.

The study further established that the contractual stakeholder-participation model influenced the implementation of the project in relation to scope, time, cost and quality as summarized by themes in table 4.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of contractual stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Jeptul market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The contract specified the structural scope of the project.
	Available space at Jeptul could not accommodate all the structures.
	The contract allowed the client to deliberately cause project cost overrun.
	The contract absolved the client from meeting extra project cost.
	The contract compelled the contractor to automatically take-on extra project cost.
	The contract led to project time overrun.
	The contractual stakeholder-participation model led to non-achievement of the structural scope of the Jeptul project and caused it to stall.
	The contract served as the legal instrument by which the client, contractor, workers and suppliers were obligated to deliver the project.
	Global Themes
The contractual model legally specified the design by which the project was to be constructed; whose non-achievement led to the stalling of the project.	
The contractual stakeholder-participation had merits and demerits; but the demerits far outweighed the merits and stalled the project.	

Table 4: Influence of contractual stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Jeptul market stalls project

In terms of scope, the contract had specific structures that were to be constructed on a predetermined size of land and the structures were to take specific positions in relation to each other on the ground (Interviewee 7). Since there was lack of enough space to accommodate all the project structures coupled with the rigid contract; it became difficult to move the toilet block to another location and this stalled the project. The study also found out that the contract stipulated that the project cost was fixed. Moreover, the client caused project delay yet the contract did not spell out any penalties for this; a situation that led to cost escalation and low quality work (interviewee 7 and 10). These themes were corroborated by another key informant who acknowledged that:

... Of course the issue of price escalation of materials coupled with the fixed nature of the contract sum would require the use of fairly low priced materials and this affected the quality of the work. However, it should be noted that the variation in terms of type of materials that were used was within the acceptable quality standards...(Interviewee 7).

The researcher physically observed that there was deterioration in terms of quality of work done due to low quality materials, lack of maintenance and vandalism. By the time the project will be commissioned, it will have definitely gone down quality-wise. Although the poor quality cannot be wholly blamed on the nature of the contract, a bigger percentage of it was attributed to the nature of the contract. Nonetheless, the contract served as the legal instrument by which the client, contractor, workers and suppliers were obligated to deliver the project. This was a positive attribute of this model in this project.

In a nut shell, the contractual stakeholder-participation had merits and demerits; but the demerits far outweighed the merits and stalled the project. It is a failed project.

c. CONSULTATIVE STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

Respondents gave data that was analyzed to give themes that suggested that the consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the Jeptul project. Basic themes were synthesized into several higher order themes as illustrated in table 5.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in Jeptul stalls market project.	Organizing Themes
	The client engaged the then Ministry of Public Works for preparation of project drawings and the BQs by consultation.
	The Hamisi CDF tender committee helped to issue tender documents to the prospective contractors; and the engagement was consultative.
	Ministry of Health officers were consulted about the health related issues about the project.
	During project monitoring, officers from the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health, and Hamisi CDF tender committee were consulted and they played a key role.
	Global Theme
Consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project.	

Table 5: Themes on consultative stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of Jeptul project

Based on the identified organizing themes, the study concluded that consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project.

Having established that consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of the Jeptul market stalls project; the study turned its attention on examining influence of the model on the implementation of the project with reference to scope, time, cost and quality. This resulted to several organizing and global themes as depicted in table 6.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of consultative stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Jeptul market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	Consultations helped to bring the client, the Ministry of Public Works, the Ministry of Health and Hamisi CDF tender committee together to work on the project.
	The consultative approach enabled the four main stakeholders to treat one another as equals and important partners.
	There were no clear coordination and communication mechanisms between the

	four groups of stakeholders and this caused project delay, cost escalation and low quality work.
	Global Theme
	Consultative stakeholder-participation model as applied had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the Jeptul project.
	However, the negative influence of the model was more predominant and affected the scope, time, cost and quality of the project structures.

Table 6: Influence of consultative stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Jeptul market stalls project

On the basis of the above organizing themes, the study concluded that although this model helped to bring key stakeholders together, its wrong application also resulted to elongated project time-frame, cost escalation and deterioration of the quality of work done. This confirms that any project that applies the consultative stakeholder-participation model should apply it in a proper way. In this model, emphasis should be laid on consultation and gathering of information from other stakeholders (especially for identifying challenges and opportunities, priority setting, and even risk factors) which information should then be applied in planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluating the project (Probst, Haggmann, Fernandez & Ashby, 2003). This did not however happen in the Jeptul project.

Consequently, the study further concluded that the consultative stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the project; where the negative influence was more predominant owing to the stalling of the project. This study further concluded that the challenge of lack of coordination and communication mechanisms in the application of this model was an indication that this model does not have capacity to address stakeholder-participation challenges that arise from its use. This goes to confirm the assertion by Clever (2001), Smith (2008), and Tseng and Penning-rowsell (2012) that conventional stakeholder-participation models are characterized by a lack of capacity to solve stakeholder-participation challenges and this delays or stalls projects.

B. CHAVAKALI MARKET STALLS PROJECT

The Chavakali ESP market stalls project is situated at Chavakali town which is along Kisumu-Kakamega road. The researcher observed that the market is located about a half a kilometer from the town center at a place that appears to be a bit isolated from the town's central business district. There were various organizing themes that pointed to the application of several stakeholder-participation models which in turn influenced the implementation of the project.

a. TOP-DOWN STAKEHOLDER-PARTICIPATION MODEL

An array of responses about the top-down stakeholder-participation model and its application in the Chavakali

market stalls project was collected and analyzed. A summary is presented in terms of themes in table 7.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The concept of building a market stalls structure in Chavakali town of Sabatia Constituency was originated by senior national Kenya government officers in Nairobi.
	Planning for the Chavakali market stalls project was done by senior national Kenya Government officers based in Nairobi.
	Project funds were paid to contractors from Nairobi throughout the project life cycle.
	The client was the most influential stakeholder and used this privilege to make the major decisions in the project; including when to pay the contractor for work done.
	After having been prepared by the ESP secretariat in Nairobi, the drawings and BQs for the project were passed down for implementation by local stakeholders.
	The Chavakali market stalls project was undertaken as an emergency project and there was no time for involving all the stakeholders in the planning and implementation of the project.
	Global Theme
	The top-down model of stakeholder-participation was used to implement the Chavakali market stalls project.

Table 7: Themes on top-down stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project

Arising from the foregoing organizing themes, the researcher arrived at the global theme (conclusion) that the top-down model of stakeholder-participation was used to implement the Chavakali market stalls project.

As far as the influence of the top-down nature by which stakeholders were engaged in the implementation of the Chavakali project was concerned, the study established various themes as shown in table 8.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of top-down model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	Some of the key stakeholders of this project were left out of the implementation process.
	Chavakali project design was implemented exactly as had been handed down from the Ministry of Local Government headquarters in Nairobi making it look quite rigid.
	The location of the project had been rejected by some of the key

	stakeholders, for being inaccessible.
	The project was located at a place that is considered risky in terms of security.
	The prospective market stalls vendors had vowed that they will not move to occupy the new market stalls when asked to do so.
	The project had stalled for it had been delayed for over over six and a half years instead of the initially planned 6 months completion period.
	Project delay in turn led to project cost escalation as a result of changes in labor, materials and transportation costs over time.
	The large open space in the main structure is not hygienically suitable for display of fresh food stuffs.
	The top-down design had a very narrow scope of what was to be sold in the stalls as it was erroneously assumed that the intended market stalls vendors deal in fresh agricultural products only; yet they also deal in dry cereals, fish etc.
	The market stalls were said to be inappropriate for they do not meet the various needs of the prospective vendors.
	The project has capacity to accommodate only 24 vendors against several thousands who are in need from across Sabatia constituency.
	Client-induced delay escalated project cost and called for use of less expensive material, labor and transport which in turn negatively lowered the quality of the project.
	There was deterioration in terms of quality of work done as well due to non-use, lack of maintenance, wear and tear, and vandalism. Owing to top-down approach, the Vihiga County was still awaiting the authority from the concerned ministry in order to chart the way forward for the project.
	The project client who initiated the project had ready funds and allocated the Chavakali market stalls project 10 million Kenya shillings.
	The Vihiga Municipal Council under which Chavakali town was

	located was under the then Ministry of Local Government (client). It was thus easy to for the client to allocate the project space without consulting any other authority.
	Global Theme
	The top-down stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of Chavakali project.
	The top-down stakeholder-participation model largely negatively influenced the project and eventually led to its stalling.

Table 8: Influence of top-down model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project

Arising from the foregoing organizing themes, the study concluded that the top-down stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of Chavakali market stalls project. Positively, the client had enough funds for the project and had readily available space for the project. On the negative side, many stakeholders were not consulted and their views about the implementation of the project were not accommodated, with the effect that "... the market stalls that have been constructed are not conducive for use by the prospective vendors, for they are too small and unsafe for storage of vendors' goods..." (Interviewee 4); and this prompted the vendors to reject the project. This finding is in tandem with the criticism that top-down participation has been seen to be lacking the local input into technical and governmental administration of projects meant for the local people (Caldwell, 1970).

b. CONTRACTUAL STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

Part of the data that the researcher collected related to the application of contractual stakeholder-participation model in the Chavakali market stalls project; and the emergent organizing themes are as summarized in table 9

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The client engaged the contractor by way of a contract.
	The contract was formal for the contract document was available, and the client, the contractor and his witness had signed it.
	There was an informal contract between the contractor and the project suppliers.
	Project workers were engaged in the project by way of an informal contract.
	Global Theme
	The contractual stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of

	Chavakali market stalls project.
--	----------------------------------

Table 9: Themes on contractual stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project

The afore-stated organizing themes formed the basis upon which the researcher arrived at the global theme (conclusion) that the contractual stakeholder-participation model was used in the implementation of Chavakali market stalls project. This involved the client and contractor on the one hand; and the contractor, the workers, and the suppliers on the other.

The influence of the contractual stakeholder-participation model is reflected in themes that emerged as summarized in table 10.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of contractual model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	Since all the structures in the design were to be in one enclosure, they were squeezed into the available space leaving very little space for movement in and around the market for the vendors and buyers.
	The client delayed project implementation by centralizing payments in Nairobi and delaying to release payments in time; yet the contract did not stipulate any penalties for this.
	The contract enabled the client to delay the project and escalate project cost without attracting any penalties.
	Some contractual obligations have not been met like full payment for the project by client, and installation of electricity by contractor. This had stalled the project.
	As a result of cost escalation which the contractor was unable to bear; coupled with the fact that the contract did not allow the contractor to do any variation outside the contract sum; the contractor used either less expensive materials or lower quantities which tended to lower the quality of the structures.
	The contractual participation of the client, contractor, workers and suppliers obligated each party to offer goods and services. This contractual engagement helped the project to attain the outputs already realized so far.
	Global Theme
The contractual stakeholder-participation model largely negatively influenced the implementation of the project because some of the contractual obligations had not been met by some of the key stakeholders leading to the stalling of the project.	

Table 10: Influence of contractual model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project

On the basis of the organizing themes in table 10, the study concluded that the contractual stakeholder-participation had both positive and negative influence on the Chavakali market stalls project. However, since some of the contractual obligations had not been met by either of the parties in the contract (client and contractor) like full payment of project funds, and installation of electricity; the project had stalled. For this matter, the study further concluded that the contractual stakeholder-participation model largely negatively influenced the implementation of the project.

c. CONSULTATIVE STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

In search for the stakeholder-participation models that were applied in the Chavakali market stalls project, themes that suggested the application consultative stakeholder-participation model were explored. The themes are summarized in table 11.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The client (the then Ministry of Local Government) opted to use consultation to engage the major stakeholders in planning, implementation, and monitoring of the project.
	The client consulted the then Ministry of Public Works who prepared project drawings and the BQs because the client did not have capacity to come up with such project documents.
	During project implementation, Ministry of Public Works officers in charge of Vihiga County were the ones who issued site instructions, supervised project implementation and generated payment certificates as well.
	During project implementation, Ministry of Health officers helped to supervise health and safety-related matters in the project.
	During project implementation, Sabatia CDF tender committee helped to issue tender documents to prospective contractors.
	The Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health and the Sabatia Constituency tender committee were engaged as part of the monitoring team for the project.
	Global Theme
	Consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project with respect to

	some of the major stakeholders.
--	---------------------------------

Table 11: Themes reflecting consultative stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project

The foregoing organizing themes led the study to the concluding global theme that consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of the Chavakali market stalls project with respect to some of the major stakeholders. This was confirmed by many key respondents including the client's representative in Vihiga County who observed that, "... the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health and the Constituency tender committees were independent entities just as my ministry was in this project. So the best engagement approach was consultative..." (Interviewee 11).

In order to address the second objective of this study with regard to this project, the study sought evidence to show that the consultative stakeholder-participation model as applied in the Chavakali market stalls project had influence on its implementation. Various themes emerged from the study as illustrated in table 12.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of consultative model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	It was possible to bring the client, the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health and the Sabatia Constituency tender committee together using consultation to work on the project while at the same time recognizing their status as independent government agencies.
	There were no structured coordination and communication mechanisms between the three main groups of stakeholders. This engendered delays in implementation of project activities.
	Global Theme
	The consultative stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the project.
	While the strength of the model enabled the project to achieve its current outputs, the negative influence is seen in the failure to terminate the project and move it to the commissioning stage and subsequent use.

Table 12: Influence of consultative model on implementation of Chavakali market stalls project

On the basis of the foregoing, the study established the global theme (conclusion) that the consultative stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the project. The positive influence is manifested in the present project outputs, while the negative one is seen in the failure to terminate the project and move it to the commissioning stage and subsequent use.

C. THE MAJENGO MARKET STALLS PROJECT

The Majengo market stalls project is located at Majengo town which is along Kisumu-Kakamega road within Vihiga County. The project site is on Majengo-Hamisi road. Various themes were identified and they pointed to the application of several stakeholder-participation models which in turn influenced the implementation of this project.

a. TOP-DOWN STAKEHOLDER-PARTICIPATION MODEL

Responses from various respondents were synthesized into themes that were later used to arrive at study conclusions on the stakeholder-participation model that was applied in this project. The emergent themes are shown in table 13.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Majengo market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The decision to construct a fresh-produce stalls market in Vihiga Constituency was made by national government officers in Nairobi.
	Funds for the project were centrally managed by the then Ministry of Local Government from Nairobi.
	The contractor was supposed to work with the then Ministry of Local Government headquarters in Nairobi for payment.
	All the planning for the project was undertaken in Nairobi, where the project drawings, the BQs and the project plan were prepared.
	The documents were passed down to Vihiga Constituency for implementation at short notice.
	No stakeholder from either the district, constituency or market committee levels was involved in the planning of the project.
	The decision to pay the contractor from Nairobi and how often to pay was made by the client without consulting other stakeholders.
	The project implementation team at Vihiga County in turn failed to involve some of the key stakeholders at the local level in project implementation.
	The client had a lot of influence on the project and unilaterally made most of the key decisions.
	Global Theme
The top-down stakeholder-participation model was used to implement the Majengo market stalls project.	

Table 13: Themes relating to top-down stakeholder-participation model in the of the Majengo market stalls project

Pattern matching involving the foregoing organizing themes led the study to the conclusion (global theme) that the top-down stakeholder-participation model was used to implement the Majengo market stalls project.

In order to address the second research objective, the study examined data to establish how the top-down model influenced implementation of Majengo market stalls project especially in terms of scope, time, cost and quality. There were several organizing themes that were identified as detailed in table 14

Focus	THEMES
Influence of top-down model on implementation of Majengo market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The client allocated the Vihiga Constituency 10 million Kenya shillings, which was enough to put up the market stalls project.
	This money enabled the project team to construct the structures so far realized in the Majengo project; which are the main structure, an office block, a toilet block, a water tank, and a concrete waste bin.
	The client had control over the Vihiga Municipal Council and went ahead to allocate the project land at Majengo town without consulting any other authority. This served to avert disagreements over project location.
	The planning of the project by the central government in Nairobi alienated all the other key stakeholders at the local level whose ideas about the project were not considered.
	The top-down model of implementation caused disenchantment amongst the prospective vendors who vowed not to occupy the new stalls if they happen to be asked to do so. Thus, they have rejected the stalls.
	Due to the top-down nature of the project, the stalls were made in a way that does not capture the scope of the needs of the prospective vendors, and contributed to their rejection.
	The project has had time overrun as it has now taken over six and a half years instead of the initially planned 24 weeks.
	The client having caused project delays of up to over six and a half years due to centralized decision-making, this led to an escalation in project cost owing to increase in labor, materials and transport costs.
	The escalated project cost led to low quality structures because at the time of this study; the floors and walls of the structures were already peeling off, the shutters of some of the stall enclosures had come off, and the fence had already fallen apart.
	Global Theme
	The top-down stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the

	project.
	The negative influence far outweighed the positive influence because as a result, the project is currently stalled while the end users have vowed not to take it up for use in its current form.

Table 14: Influence of top-down model on implementation of Majengo market stalls project

Based on the foregoing organizing themes, this study arrived at global theme that the application of the top-down model in this project had both merits and demerits to the project. However, the study noted that the model limited the participation of key stakeholders and this engendered a situation in which negative influence far outweighed the positive influence and the project had to stall. The failure of projects as a result of the top-down model is not unique to the Majengo market stalls project. Dadvar-Khani (2012) who studied rural stakeholders' participation in a rural tourism project in Kan area of Tehran in Iran established that there was lack of meaningful community participation in the development of tourism in their villages and that the government's top-down planning of rural tourism had alienated the rural communities from the project, which eventually failed to meet its objectives. Nina *et al.* (2009) and Tseng Penning-Rowell (2012) had similar findings in their studies done in Kenya and Taiwan respectively. This puts to question the real value of applying the top-down model in public development projects.

b. CONTRACTUAL STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

Various themes were identified with regard to the contractual model as presented in table 15.

FOCUS	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Majengo market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The client (who was the then Ministry of Local Government) engaged the contractor for this project using a contractual agreement. The study also found out that the contract was formal.
	There was a contract between the contractor and the project workers. This contract was informal
	Suppliers were engaged in this project by way of a contract which like for the workers, was an informal contract.
	Global Theme
	The Majengo market stalls project applied a contractual stakeholder-participation model.

Table 15: Themes alluding to contractual stakeholder-participation in the implementation of Majengo project

From table 15, the study concluded by way of a global theme that the Majengo market stalls project applied a contractual stakeholder-participation model. One of the contracts (client versus contractor) was formal while the other

two (contractor versus workers and contractor versus suppliers) were informal.

Having established that the project used a contractual stakeholder-participation model, the researcher turned attention to the possible influence of this model on project implementation with regard especially to scope, time cost and quality. Consequently, several themes that relate to the influence of the contractual model on the implementation of the project were identified. These themes are as presented in table 16.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of contractual stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Majengo market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The contract made each party to strive to deliver on its mandate and as such, it helped the project to construct all the structures that were contained in the project scope. This was a positive influence.
	The contract had a negative influence on the project because it encouraged the client to delay payments to the contractor far beyond the legally accepted limits without any penalties being applied.
	Time overrun for the project had a spiral effect on the cost of the project; and considering that this project had a fixed cost, it meant that the contractor was automatically required to foot the extra cost.
	The cost overrun that was experienced in this project in turn led to lowering of quality of standards of the structures that were constructed.
	Global Theme
	The contractual stakeholder-participation model as applied in the Majengo market stalls project had positive as well as negative influence.
	The negative influence was far more significant as compared to the positive influence; evidence being that this project had stalled for over six and half years at the time of the study.

Table 16: Influence of contractual model on implementation of Majengo market stalls project

In a nutshell, the study found out that the contractual stakeholder-participation model as applied in the Majengo market stalls project had positive as well as negative influence. However, the negative influence was far more significant as compared to the positive influence; evidence being that this project had stalled for over six and half years at the time of the study.

a. CONSULTATIVE STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

In the Majengo market stalls project, the then Ministry of Local Government was the client and had a lot of influence on the project given the dominant position that it enjoyed as the owner and funder of the project. The study established that the

client worked on the project together with the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health and Vihiga Constituency tender committee in a consultative approach given that all the parties were independent government entities (Interviewee 1, 2, 3, 7, 11, 12, 16). It was further established that the client relied on the Ministry of Public Works for project drawings, the BQs and project supervision because the client did not have the technical capacity to do carry out those duties (Interviewee 1, 2, 3, 7, 12). The client also engaged the the Ministry of Health officials for health and safety standards and Hamisi CDF tender committee which helped to issue tender documents to prospective contractors (Interviewee 1, 2, 3, 7, 12, 16). In consultation with each other, the parties also constituted a monitoring committee which monitored the project implementation.

The study thus arrived at the global theme that the consultative stakeholder participation model was used in the implementation of Majengo market stalls project. This was mainly because all these major stakeholders were independent entities in the Government of Kenya and consultation was the best approach of bringing them together to implement the project. Consequently, the consultative stakeholder-participation approach had influence on the implementation of the project in several ways.

A positive influence that the study found with regard to this model was that the consultative approach which the client adopted towards the other major stakeholders in the project helped to nurture a harmonious working relationship that led to the construction of the existing structures. The recognition of other government agencies as equal partners in the project "... made them ready and willing to work together for the success of the project ..." (Interviewee 1, 12).

However, on a negative note, the study found out that amidst all the stakeholders that were involved in the project, there were no official coordination structures between them about the project. Likewise, the study established that there lacked official communication structures to be used to coordinate the various stakeholders. This was a big lapse as there needed to be constant communication between officers of different ministries that were involved in the implementation of the project. In an interview, one of the key informants explained as follows:

... As a Public Works Ministry officer at Vihiga County, I was not sure for example whether I was supposed to write directly to another officer in the Ministry of Health at the County; or whether I was to write to the officer's seniors who would then pass over the information to the concerned officer. The biggest communication problem was however faced by the market management committees (MMCs), prospective market stalls vendors and the general public for up to date, they have no idea about what is going on about the project. We do not know who is supposed to be updating them on the progress or lack of it ... (Interviewee 7)

From the foregoing organizing themes, the study arrived at the global theme (conclusion) that the consultative stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the project as presented above. However, the negative influence was much more significant because it had resulted to the stalling of the project and the Vihiga County Government officers in charge of this project

were not sure about way forward for this project as at the time of this study. This is precisely why Probst, Haggmann, Fernandez & Ashby (2003) advise that in this model, emphasis should be laid on consultation and gathering of information from other stakeholders which information should then be applied in planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluating the project .

D. WEMILABI MARKET STALLS PROJECT

This project is located at Wemilabi shopping center on the Kima-Stand Kisa road in Vihiga County. Wemilabi shopping center is a small shopping center located in a rural area. The researcher also observed that the Wemilabi market stalls project is located a few meters away from the main road and is bordered by a line of iron-made stalls on one side and a line of shops on another side. The study established various themes that pointed to the application of several stakeholder-participation models which in turn influenced the implementation of this project.

a. TOP-DOWN STAKEHOLDER - PARTICIPATION MODEL

As far as the search for stakeholder-participation model applied in the Wemilabi market stalls project was concerned, various themes were identified presented in table 17.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The decision to put up market stalls in Emuhaya Constituency of Vihiga County was done by the Kenya central government officers in Nairobi.
	Planning for the project was done in Nairobi.
	At the time of planning, the project site had not been identified.
	Project planning was done without the involvement of other groups of stakeholders at lower levels.
	Having been prepared in Nairobi, the project plan, drawings and BQs were then passed over to the relevant lower-level stakeholders for implementation.
	The chairman of the Vihiga County Council settled on the Wemilabi shopping center as the location for the project without consulting all the relevant stakeholders including the Vihiga County public works officers, and the prospective market stalls vendors.
During implementation, the project implementation team did not consult the prospective market stalls vendors or the public in	

	general about their possible input into the project.
	The client who was based in Nairobi had the monopoly of making all the major decisions about the project; and decided without reference to the other major stakeholders of this project that all payments for the project would be done in Nairobi.
	The client decided to disregard the payment time frame without consulting other interested stakeholders.
	Global Theme Top-down stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project.

Table 17: Themes about top-down stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project

Arising from the foregoing organizing themes, the study arrived at the global theme that the top-down stakeholder-participation model was applied in the implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project.

As far as the influence of this model on the implementation of the project was concerned, the study established several themes relating to scope, time, cost and quality as summarized in table 18.

FOCUS	THEMES
Influence of top-down model on implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The client had set aside sufficient funds and allocated Emuhaya Constituency 10 million Kenya shillings, which was enough to put up the market stalls project.
	With this money, the project team was able to construct the structures so far realized in the Wemilabi project; which are the main structure, an office block, a toilet block, a water tank, and a concrete waste bin.
	The prospective vendors, other key stakeholders, and the general public were technically excluded from the planning process.
	This made the project to be implemented with a very limited scope in terms of the total number of vendors (only 24) that the stalls were to accommodate.
	The respondents indicated that the stalls are too small, insecure, inappropriate and too exposed to rains, sun, wind.
	The decision by the client to process payment from Nairobi as well as varying the payment time-frame led to incessant delays in payments to the

	contractor.
	The contractor was compelled to resort to more borrowing of financial resources in order to cater for the delayed payment. This had led to financial distress to the contractor since the client was yet to fully pay for the project at the time of this study.
	There emerged new project activities on the site which the project planner had not foreseen as a result of making project drawings and BQs without first visiting the site or getting the required information from the concerned Vihiga County Public Works officers.
	There was an escalation in the project cost. This was caused by delays in honoring payment certificates, the logistics of coordinating payment between Vihiga County and Nairobi, and the emergence of unforeseen project activities.
	Since the project cost was fixed, the contractor was forced to bear the extra cost, which constrained the contractor financially.
	As a result of the financial constraints that were experienced by the contractor, the quality of the work done was lowered.
	The project is stalled because first, it is incomplete and secondly, the client has neither officially handed it over to Vihiga County nor given direction as to what should be done with the project.
	Global Theme The top-down stakeholder-participation model had merits and demerits in the implementation of the Wemilabi project. To a greater extent, the model had a negative influence on the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project. As such, the project cannot be commissioned for use because it is incomplete in its present state, and is stalled as well.

Table 18: Influence of top-down model on implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project

A synthesis of the organizing themes in table 18 revealed a global theme that represents the conclusion that the top-down stakeholder-participation model had both positive and negative influence on the implementation of the Wemilabi project as detailed above. However, the negative influence far outweighs the positive influence. Thus, the study further concluded that to a greater extent, the model had a negative influence on the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls

project. The project cannot be commissioned for use because it is incomplete in its present state, and is stalled as well.

b. CONTRACTUAL STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

On the basis of various basic themes that emerged from research data, several higher-order themes were identified with regard to contractual stakeholder-participation model as presented in table 19.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The contractor engaged the project workers by way of an informal contract.
	The study also found out that suppliers were also engaged in this project by way of an informal contract.
	The client engaged the contractor for the project via a formal contract which the two parties and their witnesses signed.
	Global Theme
	The Wemilabi market stalls project applied a contractual stakeholder-participation model in bringing on board some of its stakeholders.

Table 19: Themes alluding to contractual stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of Wemilabi project

The study then arrived at one global theme that pointed to the conclusion that the Wemilabi market stalls project applied a contractual stakeholder-participation model in bringing on board some of its stakeholders.

Other than establishing the applied stakeholder-participation model, the study also sought to examine influence of the contractual stakeholder-participation model on implementation of Wemilabi project; and subsequently came up with various themes (table 20).

Focus	THEMES
Influence of contractual model on implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	As for the project scope, the contract led to the construction of market stalls with a limited scope of a capacity of only 24 stall vendors.
	The contract had a negative influence on the Wemilabi market stalls project as well because it allowed the client to delay payments to the contractor far beyond the legally accepted limit of 30 days.
	Project time overrun led to an increase in the cost of materials, labor and transport.
	The contractor was automatically required to foot the extra cost. In other words, the contract punished the project contractor for delays that were caused by the client.

	The project is currently stalled as there is no agreement as to who between the client and contractor should incur the cost of repairing the damaged roof and the vandalized stall shutters; for the project had a fixed cost and the damages can not be attributed to the contractor.
	The cost overrun that was experienced in this project was responsible for the low quality of the structures that were constructed.
	The contractual engagement made the client, contractor, workers and suppliers to endeavor to deliver on its mandate and as such, it helped the project to come up with the structures that are currently on site today. This was a positive influence of the model on the project.
	Global Theme
	The contractual stakeholder-participation model had positive as well as negative influence on the implementation of the project.
	The project gains were overshadowed by the fact that the project was stalled at the time of the study, meaning that the negative influence was much more predominant.

Table 20: Influence of contractual model on implementation of Wemilabi market stalls project

On the basis of the organizing themes in table 20, the study concluded that contractual stakeholder-participation model had positive as well as negative influence on the implementation of the project. Nonetheless, the project gains were overshadowed by the fact that the project was stalled at the time of the study, meaning that the negative influence had taken a big toll on the project.

c. CONSULTATIVE STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODEL

Several themes were identified about the use of the consultative stakeholder-participation model in this project as illustrated in table 21.

Focus	THEMES
Establish stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The then Ministry of Local Government was the client in this project and was a dominant stakeholder given its status as the owner and funder of the project.
	The Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health and Emuhaya Constituency tender committee were some of the other major stakeholders in this project.
	These were independent

	government agencies just like the client was, and this made the client to apply the consultative approach of engaging them in the project.
	Global Theme
	The Wemilabi market stalls project applied consultative stakeholder-participation model in its implementation.

Table 21: Themes relating to consultative stakeholder-participation model in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project

Based on the organizing themes in table 21, the study identified a global theme that represented the conclusion that the Wemilabi market stalls project applied consultative stakeholder-participation model in its implementation. Under this model, the client, the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health, Emuhaya Constituency tender committee were recognized independent entities and were engaged in the project by way of consultation.

Having established that the consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied in the Wemilabi project, the study further sought to examine the influence of this model in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project. The findings are summarized in table 22.

Focus	THEMES
Influence of consultative model on implementation of Majengo market stalls project.	Organizing Themes
	The use of the consultative approach helped to nurture cordial working relationships between the Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Health, Emuhaya Constituency tender committee, and Vihiga County Council; and this helped the project to realize the milestones present as at the time of this study.
	Because of the consultative approach, these government agencies were able to provide services to the client free of charge.
	There was lack of a clear coordination mechanism between the various stakeholders that were involved in the implementation of the project.
	There were no clear communication lines between the various stakeholders that were engaged in the implementation of this project. The lack of information to date about how the project can be operationalized is illustrative of this shortcoming.
	Global Theme
	The consultative stakeholder-participation model in the Wemilabi market stalls project had positive as well as negative influence on the project.
	The project is currently stalled partly as a result of lack of clear coordination and communication

	mechanisms between the various stakeholders.
--	--

Table 22: Influence of consultative stakeholder-participation model applied in the implementation of the Wemilabi market stalls project

On the basis of the above organizing themes, the study thus arrived at the global theme that the application of the consultative stakeholder-participation model in the Wemilabi market stalls project had positive as well as negative influence on the project. However, whereas the model helped the project to attain its current milestones, the project was stalled at the time of this study partly as a result of lack of clear coordination and communication mechanisms between the various stakeholders. This is further illustrated by the current situation where all stakeholders of this project did not know the way forward about the stalled Wemilabi market stalls project.

E. CROSS-CASE ANALYSIS

Cross-case analysis of the findings from the four projects was conducted and various cross-cutting findings were further made as presented in this section, and summarized under the following sections.

a. PROJECT CLIENT

One of the cross-cutting findings across the four projects (Jeptul, Chavakali, Majengo, Wemilabi) was that all the four market stalls projects were sponsored by one client who was the then Ministry of Local Government. This was because development of all market stalls in Kenya fell under this ministry and so were ESP market stalls projects.

b. PROJECT OBJECTIVE

The study also established that all the four projects had a similar objective of providing a market structure from where vendors would sell their fresh agricultural products. However, from the study findings, this objective will not be actualized if the projects will not be re-oriented to accommodate the needs of various stakeholders. This is a position which the respondents themselves had emphasized.

c. STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION MODELS

In relation to the first objective of this study, the study found out that all the four market stalls projects applied the top-down stakeholder participation model in their implementation. The study further established that all the projects applied the contractual stakeholder-participation model as a result of having engaged the contractors, the suppliers and workers using contracts. Moreover, it was established that the consultative stakeholder-participation model was applied by the four projects as well. The consultative approach involved the major stakeholders of this project who were the client, the Ministry of Public Works, the Ministry of Health, and the four Constituency tender committees of Hamisi, Sabatia, Vihiga and Emuhaya.

d. INFLUENCE OF STAKEHOLDER - PARTICIPATION MODELS ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FOUR PROJECTS

The second objective of this study was to examine how the applied stakeholder-participation models influenced the implementation of the selected rural ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County. Several common global themes were isolated with regard to the influence of the established stakeholder-participation models on the implementation of Jeptul, Chavakali, Majengo and Wemilabi market stalls projects. This is presented as per the models that were applied in the projects.

✓ *Top-Down Stakeholder-Participation Model*

In brief, cross-case analysis revealed that the top-down stakeholder-participation model had common positive and negative influence across the projects. The negative influence contributed to the stalling of the projects thereby turning them into failed projects. The model also had unique negative influence as was the case for Jeptul which lacks a toilet block, Chavakali that is viewed as being redundant and Wemilabi that has not been repaired after wind ripped off part of its roof. Heravi, Coffey, and Trigunarsyah, (2015) observe that stakeholders have immense influence on projects and should be managed well to avoid the negative effects that they can cause to projects. They note:

...Different stakeholders can be a part of a large project's executive team and depending on how they get involved and what their roles are, they might have different interests in, impacts on and ambitions for a project. Therefore a significant part of the project management process should be to precisely evaluate the importance and influence levels of these groups and their potential orientation towards the project... (p. 987).

✓ *Contractual Stakeholder-Participation Model*

Generally, the study found out that the contractual stakeholder-participation model had positively and negatively influenced the projects. However, the negative influence was much more profound for it had contributed to the stalling of all the projects.

✓ *Consultative Stakeholder-Participation Model*

The study established that this model fostered mutual respect which helped to nurture conducive working relations between the four major project stakeholders and this led to the achievement of the project outputs that had been registered across the four projects at the time of the study. On the other hand, it was established that there were no structured coordination and communication mechanisms between the four major groups of stakeholders. This was responsible for delays not only in decision making, but also in communicating the decisions made and the eventual implementation of these decisions to project stakeholders.

A general finding was the global theme that each of the projects applied more than one stakeholder-participation model. This confirms that several stakeholder-participation

models which are grounded on different premises/assumptions can be applied in a single project for various purposes. This is supported by Weible, Sabatier and Lubell (2004). All the four ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County applied three stakeholder-participation models namely top-down, contractual and consultative. The study also concludes that the application of these models had both positive and negative influence on the projects; but the negative influence was much more pronounced for it led to the stalling of all the four projects. Incidentally, this appears to confirm the Tseng & Penning-Rowsell's (2012) position that the existing stakeholder-participation models are unable to address the shortcomings that arise out their application in the undertaking development projects. In such circumstances, it is prudent to explore the possibility of designing and adopting more useful stakeholder-participation models as suggested by Stanghellini (2010).

IV. CONCLUSION

The study concluded that all the four ESP market stalls projects in Vihiga County applied three stakeholder-participation models namely top-down, contractual and consultative; and that the application of several stakeholder-participation models in a single project is a common trend.

Another general conclusion was that although the three models that were applied in the four market stalls projects had both positive and negative effects, it was evident that the negative effects of the models on the projects outweigh the positive ones. The negative effects were largely attributed not only to inherent limitations of the models, but also due to lack of proper application of the the models during the implementation of the projects. This situation is underscored in literature by Sherman and Ford (2014) who established in their study that, "participatory methods can fail to build local capacity and also fail to empower communities by constraining the openness of participation and limiting the contribution of participant input in project implementation" (p. 433).

The study also concluded that the negative effects of the applied models in the implementation of the four market stalls projects were responsible for the stalling of the projects for over six and a half years after the scheduled completion time, with cost overrun and low quality structures. None of the study respondents knows what should be done about the projects. Given also that the prospective market stalls vendors have already rejected the projects, the study concludes as well that the four projects can be categorized as failed projects.

Consequently, the study further concluded that the reviewed stakeholder-participation models lack capacity to deliver successful projects mainly as a result of their inherent limitations. The top-down model for instance does not value the inclusion of all stakeholders at every level of decision making and this was evident in the four projects. The Contractual model has the tendency to bind stakeholders to undertake activities which may not be in the best interests of the project or some of the stakeholders, as it happened in the four projects where the contractors were forced to take on extra costs caused by the client without any remedial avenue.

The consultative model can only work well in cases where there are proper coordination and communication channels, but this was missing in the four market stalls projects.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

This study recommended that the Kenya Government should design a policy that makes the planning and implementation of all publicly funded projects to be inclusive of all the stakeholders as the best way of harnessing all stakeholder views and interests, fostering teamwork and minimizing disputes about projects.

Project implementation teams should also look beyond the current stakeholder-participation models which lack capacity to deliver successful projects and instead devise more beneficial stakeholder-participation models (Bierele, 2002; Stanghellini, 2010; Tseng & Penning-Rowsell, 2012).

VI. SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

One of the conclusions of this study was that the four ESP market stalls projects that were constructed in Vihiga County had been shunned by the very people they were meant to benefit. The study further concluded that whatever funds that were spent on this project have been wasted; and this sentiment was well summarized by one of the key informants who remarked that, "... it is a total waste of scarce public resources that should have been put to a more useful cause elsewhere. It is a wasted effort..." (Interviewee 12). Consequently, this study proposes that a bigger study should be conducted on the other 206 market stalls projects that were put up in the other 206 constituencies in Kenya then, with the objective of establishing their status. This will show if the billions of Kenya shillings (2,060,000,000) that were spent on the 206 projects were worth the investment; and the projects' contribution to the fresh produce marketing infrastructure and income in Kenya.

REFERENCES

- [1] Attride-Stirling, J. (2001). Thematic networks: An analytic tool for qualitative research. In *Qualitative Research*, 1, 385. DOI: 10.1177/146879410100100307
- [2] Baumann, C., & White, S. (2015). Collaborative Stakeholder Dialogue: A Catalyst for Better Transport Policy Choices. *International Journal of Sustainable Transportation*, 9 (1), 30-38, DOI: 10.1080/15568318.2012.720357
- [3] Badu, E., Owusu-Manu, D., Edwards, D.J., Adesi, M., & Lichtenstein, S. (2013). Rural infrastructure development in the Volta region of Ghana: barriers and interventions. *Journal of Financial Management of Property and Construction*, 18 (2), 142 – 159. DOI:10.1108/JFMPC-11-2012-0040
- [4] Bierele, T.C. (2002). The quality of stakeholder-based decisions. *Risk analysis*, 22, 739–49.
- [5] Boon, B., Bawole, J.N., & Ahenkan, A. (2013). Stakeholder participation in community development projects: An analysis of the quadripartite model of the International Center for Enterprise and Sustainable Development (ICED) in Ghana. *Community development*, 44: (1), 38-54. DOI: 10.1080/15575330.2011.651729
- [6] Borisova, T., Racevskis, L., & Kipp, J. (2012). Stakeholder Analysis of a Collaborative Watershed Management Process: A Florida Case Study. *Journal of the American Water Resources Association (JAWRA)*, 48(2), 277-296. DOI: 10.1111/j.1752-1688.2011.00615.x
- [7] Burke, J. & Larry, C. (2012). *Educational Research: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches*, 4th Ed. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- [8] Caldwell, L.K. (1970). *Environment: A challenge for modern society*. New York: Natural History Press.
- [9] Chambers, R., (1997). *Whose reality counts? Putting the last first*. London: Intermediate Technology.
- [10] Cleaver, F., (2001). *Institutions, agency and the limitations of participatory approaches to development*.
- [11] In B. Cooke & U. Kothari, (Eds), *Participation – the new tyranny?* (pp. 36–55). London: Zed Books.
- [12] Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- [13] Donovan, D. R. (2013). Forgotten farmers: Poverty and development in rural Africa. *PLoS ONE*, 6 (1). doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0014551 Retrieved on 20th November, 2015 from africa.watch@consultancyafrica.com
- [14] Dyll-Myklebust, L. (2014) Development narratives: The value of multiple voices and ontologies in Kalahari research. *Critical Arts: South-North Cultural and Media Studies*, 28(3), 521-538. DOI:10.1080/02560046.2014.929214
- [15] Dadvar-Khani, D. (2012). Participation of rural community and tourism development in Iran. *Community Development*, 43 (2), 259-277. DOI: 10.1080/15575330.2011.604423
- [16] Geaves, L. H., & Penning-Rowsell, E., C. (2014). Contractual' and 'cooperative' civic engagement: The emergence and roles of 'flood action groups' in England and Wales. *Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences*, 1-12. DOI: 10.1007/s13280-014-0576-x
- [17] Gillespie, P. (2012). Participation and power in Indonesian oil palm plantations. *Asia Pacific Viewpoint*, 53, (3), 254-271. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-8373.2012.01494.x
- [18] GoK. (2010). *The constitution of Kenya*. Nairobi: Government Printers.
- [19] Heravi, A., Coffey, V., Trigunarsyah, B. (2015). Evaluating the level of stakeholder involvement during the project planning processes of building projects. *International Journal of Project Management*, 33, 985 – 997.
- [20] Koontz, T.M. & Newig, J. (2014). From Planning to Implementation: Top-Down and Bottom-Up Approaches for Collaborative Watershed Management. *Policy studies Journal*, 42, (3), 416-442.

- [22] Larson, K.L., & Lach, D. (2008). Participants and non-participants of place-based groups: An assessment of attitudes and implications for public participation in water resource management. *Journal of Environment Management*, 88, 817–30.
- [23] Lazarus, S., Naidoo, A.V., May, B., Williams, L., Demas, G., & Filander, F.J. (2014). Lessons learnt from a community-based participatory research project in a South African rural context. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 44(2), 149–161.
- [24] Leahy, T., & Goforth, M. (2014) Best practice for rural food security projects in Southern Africa? *Development in Practice*, 24 (8), 933-947. DOI:10.1080/09614524.2014.969196
- [25] Leon, Y. (2005). Rural development in Europe: A research frontier for agricultural economists. *European Review of Agricultural Economics*, 32 (3), 301–317. doi:10.1093/eurag/jbi012
- [26] Mc Millan & Schumachers (2001). *Research in Education. A conceptual Introduction*. (5th ed). New York: Addison Wesley Longman, Inc
- [27] Nchuchuwe, F. F., & Adejuwon, K.D. (2012). The Challenges of Agriculture and Rural Development in Africa: The Case of Nigeria. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 1 (3), 45-61.
- [28] Nina et al., H., Omoro, L., Pellikka, P., & Luukkanen, O. (2009). The benefits and of participation in forest management. The case of Taita Hills, Kenya. *Fennia*, 187 (1), 61– 76.
- [29] Probst, K., Hagmann, J., Fernandez, M., & Ashby, J. (2003). Understanding participatory research in the context of natural resource management paradigms, approaches and typologies. Downloaded from www.odi.org/resources/docs/5194.pdf on 10th November, 2015.
- [30] Reed, M.S. (2008). Stakeholder participation for environmental management: A literature review. *Biological Conservation*, 141, 2417–19.
- [31] Sakaki, M., & Koga, K. (2013). An effective approach to sustainable small - scale irrigation developments in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Paddy Water Environ*, 11, 1–14. DOI 10.1007/s10333-011-0287-x
- [32] Schwandt, T.A (1997). *Qualitative inquiry: A dictionary of terms*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- [33] Scott, T. (2015). Does collaboration make any difference? Linking collaborative governance to environmental outputs. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 34, (3), 537–566. DOI:10.1002/pam.21836
- [34] Sherman, M. H., & Ford, J. (2014). Stakeholder engagement in adaptation interventions: An evaluation of projects in developing nations. *Climate Policy*, 14 (3), 417-441. DOI: 10.1080/14693062.2014.859501
- [35] Smith, J.L. (2008). A critical appreciation of the “bottom-up” approach to sustainable water management: Embracing complexity rather than desirability. *Local Environment: The International Journal of Justice and Sustainability*, 13 (4), 353–366. DOI: 10.1080/13549830701803323
- [36] SRK Consulting (2011). *Mongbwalu project stakeholder engagement plan*. Northlands (South Africa): SRK Consulting.
- [37] Stanghellini, P.S.L. (2010). Stakeholder involvement in water management: the role of the stakeholder analysis within participatory processes. *Water policy*, 5, 675–94.
- [38] Tseng, C., & Penning-rowsell, E.C (2012). Micro-political and related barriers to stakeholder engagement in flood risk management. *The geographical journal*, 178 (3), 253–269. DOI: 10.1111/j.1475-4959.2012.00464.x
- [39] Vernooy, R., Qiu, S., & Xu, J. (2006). The power of participatory monitoring and evaluation: Insights from South-west China. *Development in Practice*, 16(5), 400-411, DOI: 10.1080/09614520600792275
- [40] Wambugu, L.N, Kyalo, N.D, Mbii, M. & Nyonje, R.O. (2015). *Research methods: Theory and practice*. Nairobi: Aura Books.
- [41] Weible, C., Sabatier, P.A., Lubell, M. (2004). A comparison of a collaborative and top-down approach to the use of science in policy: Establishing marine protected areas in California. *The Policy Studies Journal*, 32, (2).
- [42] Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods*, (4th Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.